



San Francisco Public Utilities Commission  
Citizens' Advisory Committee  
Power Subcommittee

MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, December 12, 2023  
5:30 p.m. – 7:00 p.m.  
525 Golden Gate Ave., 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Tuolumne Conference Room

**MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC MAY OBSERVE AND PARTICIPATE VIA ZOOM  
VIRTUAL CONFERENCE SOFTWARE**

Meeting URL

<https://sfwater.zoom.us/j/83236943738?pwd=WmR5dkQ1Y21QVtFbGIXaWxBBeVZIUT09>

Phone Dial-in

669.219.2599

Find your local number: <https://sfwater.zoom.us/j/kWXply9U>

Meeting ID / Passcode

832 3694 3738 / 493552

**Mission:** The Power Subcommittee shall review power generation and transmission system reliability and improvement programs, including but not limited to facilities siting and alternatives energy programs, as well as other relevant plans, programs, and policies ([Admin. Code Article XV, Sections 5.140 - 5.142](#)).

Members

**Chair Emily Algire (D5)**      Barklee Sanders (D6)      Moisés García (D9)  
Jodi Soboll (M- Eng./Fin.)      Sally Chen (D3)

D = District Supervisor appointed, M = Mayor appointed, B = Board President appointed

**Staff Liaisons:** Lexus Moncrease, Sharon Liu-Bettencourt  
Staff Email for Public Comment: [cac@sfwater.org](mailto:cac@sfwater.org)

**ORDER OF BUSINESS**

**1. Call to order and roll call**

Members present at roll call: (4) Algire, Chen, Sanders, and Soboll

Members Absent: (1) García

Members of the Public: None

Staff: Margaret Hannaford, and Ethan Billigmeier

**2. Approve [October 10, 2023](#) Minutes**

Motion was made (Sanders) and seconded (Soboll) to approve the September 5, 2023, Minutes.

**London N. Breed**  
Mayor

**Tim Paulson**  
President

**Anthony Rivera**  
Vice President

**Newsha K. Ajami**  
Commissioner

**Sophie Maxwell**  
Commissioner

**Kate H. Stacy**  
Commissioner

**Dennis J. Herrera**  
General Manager



AYES: (4) Algire, Chen, Sanders, and Soboll

NOES: (0)

ABSENT: (1) García

Public Comment: None

**3. Report from the Chair**

- Welcome members, staff, and the public
  - Welcome New Member
- Ohlone Tribal Land Acknowledgement

Public Comment: None

**4. Public Comment: Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda**

Public Comment: None

**5. Presentation and Discussion: [SFPUC Wildfire Mitigation Plan](#), Margaret Hannaford, P.E., Hetch Hetchy Water and Power Division Manager & Ethan Billigmeier, Wildfire Mitigation & Recovery Analyst, Hetch Hetchy Water and Power**

*Presentation*

- Wildfire Mitigation Plan
- SFPUC Owns and Maintains Assets within Wildfire Risk Area
- Wildfire Safety Advisory Board (WSAB)
- High Fire Threat Districts
- Wildfire Mitigation Plans Principle
- How Does SFPUC Mitigate Wildfires? Vegetation Management
- How Does SFPUC Mitigate Wildfires? Asset/Facility Inspections
- How Does SFPUC Mitigate Wildfires? System Hardening
- Tree/Vegetation Removal Project Areas
- Tree/Vegetation Removal Project Photos
- Plan Metrics and Evaluation
- Questions?

*Discussion*

- **Member Soboll** asked if PUC provides power to new construction projects in San Francisco and if all new constructions have lines underground.

**Staff Hannaford** responded that new projects in San Francisco are out of high fire threat zones and many of those lines are underground and come from PG&E facilities.

- **Member Soboll** asked if our power lines went through any high risk areas.

**Staff Hannaford** responded that there is one overhead line in Riverbank near the town of Oakdale but otherwise, our transmission lines do not serve other customers.

**Member Soboll** asked if other precautions are being taken to ensure the overhead lines are safe.

**Staff Hannaford** responded that the line in the overbank is in a commercial residential area and that SFPUC does maintain the vegetation there.

- **Member Sanders** asked if the SFPUC had looked into removing all the powerlines and creating microgrids to maintain safer infrastructure.

**Staff Billigmeier** commented that our powerhouse uses hydrogen, and that micro hydrogen cannot support the power our powerhouses need.

**Staff Hannaford** commented that we generate 400 megawatts of power to deliver the water supply and switching to solar would be very expensive. She further commented that other distribution lines do not serve residential areas but rather dams and release facilities however, there are areas where SFPUC is considering replacing some high-risk distribution lines using micro hydrogen and backing up staff housing with some type of solar.

- **Member Sanders** asked what percentage of the SFPUC is working on converting to microgrids over old maintenance and infrastructure.

**Staff Hannaford responded** she has a strong desire to remove distribution poles out of parks and recommends putting a small generator in the O'Shaughnessy area which would remove 7 miles of lines and the Cherry area would reduce another 10-15 miles. She noted we are minimizing our risk by limiting trees in the lines but managing less lines would reduce even more risk

- **Member Chen** asked what the labor landscape looks like for vegetation management and what things are influencing turnover and retention rates and if the goal is to contract out or be completely in house.

**Staff Billigmeier** responded Hetchy would like everything to be done in house due to institutional knowledge and there are a lot of 2- or 3-year positions, but the goal is to convert to permanent civil service positions.

**Staff Hannaford** commented they had been waiting for a labor list for over a year and they recently got approval to hire permanent exempt but there's limitations in the budget to add more positions.

- **Staff Algire** asked where the removed trees go. She also asked about the historical ecosystem of these areas.

**Staff Billigmeier** responded that unsalvageable trees get chipped and Hetchy also has a wood mill, so some trees get made into lumber, and on some rare circumstances, trees that have monetary value were sold to the local lumbermill. He further commented that the area is known as the pine belt and there are pine trees above 3,500 feet and oak and grasslands around 2,000 feet and below. There has not been much change in the ecosystem. The

department also focuses on replacing unwanted vegetation with native vegetation.

- **Member Soboll** asked to see PG&E's plans.

**Staff Billigmeier** responded that all PG&E's wildfire mitigation plans are on their websites.

**Member Soboll** asked if PG&E follow their plans.

**Staff Billigmeier** responded PG&E are supposed to follow their plans but are unsure if they did.

- **Member Soboll** gave an example of a time when PG&E asked a resident to pay for a line to be moved underground. She asked where to find PG&E's mitigation plan.

**Staff Billigmeier** responded that might have to do with disaster reimbursement.

**Member Soboll** commented if PG&E were planning on moving lines underground, they would have had to move the lines regardless.

**Staff Billigmeier** commented PG&E promised to move 10,000 miles of lines underground in 10 years.

- **Member Sanders** asked how at-risk communities were identified.

**Staff Billigmeier** responded they used the State Fire Marshall's documents to address what they considered at-risk communities for fires.

**Member Sanders** asked if there's a guideline or administrative code.

**Member Soboll** responded that it's a technical code regarding how severe the fire risk is.

**Staff Billigmeier** commented that if Member Sanders provided a contact information, he could send some information later how fire risk maps are created.

- **Member Chen** asked about what goes into the decision to deenergize and what does it look like and who is impacted.

**Staff Billigmeier** responded there is no formal program because the power is mostly to our own facilities. The factors are wind speed and wind gust. The department also spent a lot of time removing vegetation so that lines could be kept on more often. De-energization is a last resort and most de-energization events only last 24 hours, sometimes even around 12 hours.

- **Staff Algire** asked what the SFPUC could do to improve on the process of wildfire mitigation.

**Staff Hannaford** responded that they could use more permanent staff positions. She also hopes for funding for additional changes, such as putting in micro units.

**Staff Billigmeier** commented that he wishes for funding for high priority projects such as replacing aging assets with less fire prone assets.

Public Comment: None

**6. Presentation, Discussion, and Possible Action: [Resolution Regarding Emergency Authorizations and Power Outages on Treasure Island](#), Barklee Sanders, CAC Member**

*Discussion*

- **Member Sanders** suggested updating the number of power outages from 474 to 481. He also suggested updating the date from September 5, 2023, to December 12, 2023.
- The number of power outages was changed from 474 to 481.
- The date was changed from September 5, 2023, to December 12, 2023.
- **Member Sanders** commented that while neither the SFPUC, the mayor nor the Board of Supervisors possesses the authority to compel TIDA to stabilize the grid on Treasure Island, on July 20, 2017, under File number 17064 the San Francisco Board of Supervisors passed resolution R03037-17 approving emergency declaration by the SFPUC commission according to administrative code 2115 for the replacement of two generators that serve Treasure Island and Yerba Buena to ensure power reliability in the event of significant power loss. He noted the two generators cost 1.6 million to replace.

**Member Soboll** inquired as to the relevance of resolution R03037-17.

**Member Sanders** responded that we were under the impression that TIDA had to replace the generators, but the Board of Supervisors were able to force TIDA to replace the generators. He noted one generator failed and the other was past their useful life.

**Member Soboll** asked if this adds to anything to the resolution R03037-17.

**Member Sanders** responded that it seems like the Board of Supervisors has the authority to compel TIDA.

**Member Soboll** responded it doesn't mean the Board of Supervisors had that authority but rather special authority over those two generators. She noted we can leave the resolution as it is or take out the Board of Supervisors.

**Member Sanders** enquired whether the SFPUC should be taken out as well. He further states that the document was signed by the general manager.

**Member Soboll** asked if member Sanders wanted to take out that language and not put anything else in.

**Member Sanders** responded that he wanted to put in a specific example.

**Member Algire** suggested adding something such as “In the past there have been special measures where...”

**Member Sanders** stated again that he wanted to be specific, to the resolution numbers at least.

**Member Soboll** responded that being specific does not help this resolution because it doesn't seem like TIDA or anyone else is saying “You can't make me do it”.

**Member Sanders** responded he had all this context in the original resolution but was told to remove it. He commented he approved all the edits everyone made but he publicly wants people to know that the Board of Supervisors has done things under emergency resolutions to hold people accountable. He noted SFPUC does not want to solve this problem, or they would have already done it.

**Member Soboll** responded that maybe we can take out saying they can do it, but she does not want to put in this example. She feels it is not worth adding.

**Member Algire** stated she agreed with Member Soboll. She asked who put the section regarding the authority of SFPUC and the Board of Supervisors in the original resolution.

**Member Sanders** responded it was originally put in by staff or possibly Member Garcia.

**Member Algire** commented that there is a lot of confusion and that language that cannot be in the resolutions keeps popping up. She noted it's important to keep the language up regarding what the various offices can do.

**Member Sanders** responded that he is not saying they can do it but rather that they did do it in the past.

**Member Soboll** commented that the resolution said that the Board of Supervisors do not have the authority to compel TIDA to stabilize the grids.

**Member Sanders** said that the Board of Supervisors did compel TIDA with the resolution.

**Member Soboll** responded that the Board of Supervisors did not compel TIDA to stabilize the grid but rather to replace the two generators.

**Member Sanders** responded the generators are part of the grid.

**Member Soboll** commented that the Board of Supervisors cannot get TIDA to stabilize the grid but that they can get them to do a specific thing. She noted the resolution was based on economic feasibility and maybe the committee can convince them it's economically feasible as well. She asked if we want to add some statement that says something can be done but noted this does not add value.

**Member Sanders** responded that he wants to give an example of when an emergency is declared.

**Member Soboll** responded that she disagrees.

- **Member Sanders** commented that 60% of residents are considered low income and he want to add that on July 27<sup>th</sup> an emergency resolution was passed.

**Member Soboll** asked who he wants to know this.

**Member Sanders** responded, the Board of Supervisors and the public.

**Member Algire** responded that there's two different ways to convince people to do the things both members want done and asked how we can compromise.

**Member Soboll** responded that this resolution is very good already and has a page and half of clarification.

- **Member Soboll** commented that the goal is to get this resolution out soon and to get it on the January full committee agenda and therefore, they should not change anything and see what questions the full committee has.

**Member Sanders** responded that he compromised by making the edits and wants to know how no one in the SFPUC knew about the generator resolution and noted that the resolution number should be included so that they have the whole context for the resolution. He noted the point of the resolution is to file another emergency for the entire grid.

**Member Algire** noted they are eight minutes over time and voting needs to happen and commented they can vote to add the language, keep the resolution as is or table the resolution until the February meeting.

**Member Chen** suggested looking at a similar resolution such as the resolution in support of electric grid reliability on Treasure Island in 2022, to make sure this resolution is providing new information.

**Member Algire** calls a vote to take out the statement "WHEREAS, Neither the SFPUC, the Mayor, nor the Board of Supervisors possess the authority to compel TIDA to stabilize the grid, and..."

- Motion was made (Sanders) and not seconded. The amendment does not pass.
- **Staff Randazzo** commented that staff has some concerns regarding the timeline and a couple of the clauses and wanted to have a conversation.

**Member Soboll** asked if the concerns are regarding only the timeline or the actual wording as well.

**Staff Randazzo** responded it's just the timeline and there are two references to reporting back within six weeks once the resolution passes. Staff noted she doesn't think staff got a chance to weigh in on that timeline and Staff would like to have a conversation regarding that timeline.

**Member Algire** asked when these findings were found because the timeline was passed two months ago.

**Staff Randazzo** responded that she did not realize the language was passed two months again and thought it was new but will let staff know about that.

**Member Soboll** commented that she has no problem changing the dates.

**Member Algire** calls a motion to change the dates.

- Motion was made (Algire) and seconded (Soboll). The amendment to the resolution passes.

AYES: (4) Algire, Chen, Sanders, and Soboll

NOES: (0)

ABSENT: (1) García

Public Comment: None

- Member Algire calls a motion to include the file number and the resolution number.

Motion was made (Sanders) and seconded (Soboll).

AYES: (4) Algire, Sanders, and Soboll

NOES: (0)

ABSENT: (1) García, Chen

Public Comment: None

## **7. Staff report**

Public Comment: None

## **8. Future Agenda Items and Resolutions**

- Purchase Power Contract
- IEPR from the CEC
- TI Resolution Report back
- Bayview Power
- Emergency Preparedness
- Power Enterprise Training
- Legislative Update – Federal and State
- Electrification: San Francisco Climate Action Plan
- Municipalization: Interconnection, FERC Order 568, CCSF Purchase Offer
- Electric Rates & Equity
- Power Enterprise Residential & Commercial Power Programs: Heat Pumps, CAP
- California Community Choice Aggregation Residential & Commercial Power Programs
- Redevelopment Projects: Hunter's Point Shipyard & Treasure Island
- Time-of-Use Rates Update
- Reliability: Wildfires and Public Safety Power Shutoffs

Adopted Resolutions for Follow Up

- Resolution Recommending that the SFPUC Commission Reverses its Position on the "Not to Exceed Rates" for CleanPowerSF, Move Forward with this Important Program, and Allow Staff to Move Forward with its Launch [adopted September 16, 2014](#)
- Resolution in Support of SB 612 Electrical Corporations and other Load-Serving Entities [adopted on July 20, 2021](#)
- Resolution in Supporting of the Transition of CleanPowerSF Residential Customers to Time-of-Use Rates [adopted on July 20, 2021](#)

Public Comment: None

- 9. Announcements/Comments** Visit [www.sfpuc.org/cac](http://www.sfpuc.org/cac) for confirmation of the next scheduled meeting, agenda, and materials.

Public Comment: None

## 10. Adjournment

Motion was made (Algire) and seconded (Sanders) to adjourn the meeting.

Meeting was adjourned at 7:27pm.

For more information concerning the agendas, minutes, and meeting information, please visit [www.sfwater.org/cac](http://www.sfwater.org/cac). For more information concerning the CAC, please contact by email at [cac@sfwater.org](mailto:cac@sfwater.org) or by calling (415) 517-8465.

## Disability Access

The following services are available on request 48 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Lexus Moncrease at (415) 517-8465 or our TTY at (415) 554-3488 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical-based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call our accessibility hotline at (415) 554-6789.

## LANGUAGE ACCESS

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Committee. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact Lexus Moncrease at (415) 517-8465, or [cac@sfwater.org](mailto:cac@sfwater.org) at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據三藩市行政法第91章"語言服務條例", 中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語口譯服務在有人提出要求後會提供。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會後要求提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也可提供。請於會議前至少48小時致電 (415) 517-8465 或電郵至 [\[cac@sfgov.org\]](mailto:cac@sfgov.org) Lexus Moncrease 提出口譯要求。逾期要求, 在可能狀況下會被考慮。

## ACCESO A IDIOMAS

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "*Language Access Ordinance*" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "*Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code*") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Los minutos podrán ser traducidos, de ser requeridos, luego de ser aprobados por la comité. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con Lexus Moncrease al (415) 517-8465, o [cac@sfgov.org](mailto:cac@sfgov.org) por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

## PAG-ACCESS SA WIKA

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komite. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Lexus Moncrease at (415) 517-8465, o [cac@sfgov.org](mailto:cac@sfgov.org) sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago ang miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

## Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

**Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the San Francisco Ethics Commission at 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220 San Francisco, CA 94102, Phone: (415) 252-3100/Fax: (415) 252-3112, Email: [ethics.commission@sfgov.org](mailto:ethics.commission@sfgov.org).**

**Know your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, by mail to Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244 San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; by telephone 415-554-7724, by Fax 415-554-7854, or by email: [sof@sfgov.org](mailto:sof@sfgov.org)**

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.