



**San Francisco Public Utilities Commission  
 Citizens' Advisory Committee  
 Wastewater Subcommittee**

**MEETING MINUTES**

**Tuesday, January 10, 2023  
 5:30 p.m. – 7:00 p.m.**

**PARTICIPATE VIA ZOOM VIRTUAL CONFERENCE SOFTWARE**

**Meeting URL**

<https://sfwater.zoom.us/j/83425990149?pwd=T0xBaUoxdVpYUXN2NFg4ZWk3RE4yUT09>

**Phone Dial-in**

669.219.2599

Find your local number: <https://sfwater.zoom.us/u/kolNZGz3v>

**Meeting ID / Passcode**

834 2599 0149 / 211300

This meeting is being held by Teleconference Pursuant to the Governor's Executive Order N-29-20 and the Sixteenth Supplement to Mayoral Proclamation Declaring the Existence of a Local Emergency Dated February 25, 2020

During the Coronavirus Disease (COVID-19) emergency, the San Francisco Public Utilities Citizens' Advisory Committee's (SFPUC CAC) regular meeting room, 525 Golden Gate Ave., 3rd Floor Tuolumne Conference Room, is closed. CAC Members and SFPUC staff will convene CAC meetings remotely by teleconference. Members of the public are encouraged to submit their public comment on agenda items in advance of the teleconference meeting by emailing comments to [cac@sfwater.org](mailto:cac@sfwater.org). Comments submitted no later than 12 PM Tuesday the day of the meeting will be read into the record by SFPUC CAC Staffing Team members during the teleconference meeting and will be treated as a substitute to providing public comment during the meeting. Persons who submit written public comment in advance on an agenda item or items will not be permitted to also provide public comment on the same agenda item(s) during the meeting.

**Mission:** The Wastewater Subcommittee shall review sewage and stormwater collection, treatment, and disposal system replacement, recycling, and other relevant plans, programs, and policies ([Admin. Code Article XV, Sections 5.140 - 5.142](#)).

**Members**

<b>Amy Nagengast, Chair (D8)</b>	Maika Pinkston (M-Enviro. Org)	Michelle Pierce (B-Enviro. Justice)
Douglas Jacuzzi (D4)	Moisés García (D9)	

**D = District Supervisor appointed, M = Mayoral appointed, B = Board President appointed**

**OUR MISSION:** To provide our customers with high-quality, efficient, and reliable water, power and sewer services in a manner that values environmental and community interests and sustains the resources entrusted to our care.

**London N. Breed**  
 Mayor

**Newsha Ajami**  
 President

**Sophie Maxwell**  
 Vice President

**Tim Paulson**  
 Commissioner

**Tony Rivera**  
 Commissioner

**Kate Stacy**  
 Commissioner

**Dennis J. Herrera**  
 General Manager



## **ORDER OF BUSINESS**

### **1. Call to order and roll call at 5:33 pm**

Members present at roll call: (5) Nagengast, Jacuzzi, García, Pierce, and Pinkston

Members Absent: (0)

Staff presenters: Nohemy Revilla

Members of the Public: Susan Hinton

### **2. Approve [November 8, Minutes](#)**

Motion was made (Jacuzzi) and seconded (Pierce) to approve the November 8, 2022, Minutes.

AYES: (5) Nagengast, Jacuzzi, García, Pierce, and Pinkston

NOES: (0)

ABSENT: (0)

Public Comment: None

### **3. Report from the Chair**

- Welcome members, staff, and the public
- Update on the Watershed Approach resolution
- Member Jacuzzi commented that there was high fecal content in the waterways during the during the recent storms and sewage flowed into homes on the West side, so he stressed that rooftops should be disconnected from the combined sewer system.

Public Comment: None

### **4. Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda (*2 minutes per speaker*)

Public Comment: None

### **5. Presentation and Discussion: [SFPUC Air Quality - Future Odor Control Systems for Headworks and Biosolids Project](#), Nohemy Revilla, PE, Wastewater Enterprise**

## *Presentation*

- Sewer System Improvement Program
- Headworks Odor Control Facility
- Odor Control Facility Fits Between SEP 012 and SEP 042
- Headworks Odor Control Facility Layout
- Visualization
- Headworks Odor Control Facility
- SEP Biosolids Digester Facilities Project Odor Control Facility
- Site Plan View – Solids Odor Control
- BDFP Odor Control Facility
- BDFP Odor Control Facility Foul Air Sources
- Process Flow Diagram

## *Discussion*

- **Chair Nagengast** asked where air quality monitoring will be placed and asked where the analytics were on the Headworks that would deliver the results.

**Staff Revilla** shared an illustration that depicted the measuring points before the ammonia scrubbers. She commented that the SFPUC has a H<sub>2</sub>S (hydrogen sulfide), and pH monitor to make sure the pH is low enough to achieve ammonia removal. Staff Revilla also pointed out in the illustration where they could grab samples with their instruments at different points including after the fans, before the activator carbon units, and at the stacks.

- **Member Pierce** asked if there will be continuous monitoring and reporting out to the community and she also asked how the community could access those numbers.

**Staff Revilla** responded that she was not sure how that information could be shared and noted that data could be downloaded somehow.

- **Member Pierce** commented that there should be a dashboard where the Wastewater Subcommittee could see the numbers in real time if continuous monitoring is being done. She commented that her block ends at the treatment facility, so she would like to know when there are weird odors and what is escaping. Pierce added that the SFPUC occasionally needs to vent the digesters before they hit the odor controls and those sulfurous elements end up in her air as well. She noted that she used to receive notifications from the environmental justice team at the SFPUC when those events would occur, and she would like to know how the community could access that information as well.

**Staff Revilla** responded that she was not sure. She commented that this was another treatment facility that will have good numbers when the digester is vented because it is treating the foul air.

- **Member Pierce** commented that occasionally, the numbers are weird. She noted how she and Pinkston are impacted personally due to the flooding and the odors. Pierce commented that the odor control for the new facility sounds much more advanced, but given what is currently

there, there are still tons of foul odors coming off. She added that until a year ago, she was receiving weekly reports and immediate notifications to forward to the community whenever there were events that might cause the air quality to go down. Pierce noted that as a biochemical engineer, the benefit of those reports was that she could let community members know what the odors were and whether they were safe because as difficult as the odors can be, the more concerning issue was the odorless cancer-causing agents that might be released. Pierce added that she was working on having a couple community monitors posted at that site when Harlan Kelly was the director there, but the offer to have the community members place those monitors has gone away completely because the newer facilities have their own advanced air quality monitors. She noted that she was interested in the SFPUC working with the community or the Wastewater Subcommittee to set up a site that will provide information to the extent that it is legally possible. Pierce commented that this was a time for the SFPUC to be more transparent because there is more danger due to climate change and noted that the system is actually more problematic regarding pollution and odor controls during extremely dry high heat events.

- **Member García** commented that his concern was that the community monitoring program had stopped because the Full CAC had a presentation on that, and it had been proceeding so well. He added that it was concerning to hear that it was no longer the case.

**Staff Revilla** responded that she could inquire on this because she is unsure on the background information for the monitoring. She commented that she has been working for the City for 18 years but this is her first time hearing about it.

- **Chair Nagengast** asked who else at the Wastewater Enterprise was working with air quality because there was a fact sheet made.

**Staff Revilla** responded that she could talk with her supervisor about this, but because this is her first time hearing about the monitoring program, she is not sure.

- **Member García** shared the following link [https://www.sfpuc.org/sites/default/files/about-us/agendas-minutes/CAC\\_012120-Agenda.pdf](https://www.sfpuc.org/sites/default/files/about-us/agendas-minutes/CAC_012120-Agenda.pdf), which was for the presentation on the Southeast Treatment Plant Projects Air Emissions and Mitigation from January 21, 2020 and the presentation on the update for Community Air Quality Monitoring Efforts by Javier Padilla on November 19, 2019 so that Staff could have a better idea of who the initial presenters were.
- **Chair Nagengast** asked Staff to access the presentations and link them to this agenda and use them as documentation for a future agenda item. She then commented that it would be great to work with the Wastewater Enterprise to figure out who the best person could be for community outreach regarding air quality and noted that maybe this has to do with infrastructure, which is why there is a disconnect. She added that there must be continuous monitoring given how many complaints and issues there are.

- **Staff Revilla** commented that the odor control system pulls air from different resources and that monitoring at different points in the system is important, but it is just a small portion of the whole system. She added that the odors do not always come from the plant because they could also come from the sewer due to the combined system. Staff Revilla noted that the SFPUC cannot add chemicals to the whole system, which consists of more than 1,000 miles.

**Member Pierce** responded that her neighborhood, which has older structures, does not have many HVAC (Heating, Ventilation, and Air Conditioning) systems attached to the buildings, so ventilation is not an option because their ventilation is the outdoor air that stinks. She added that part of the reporting that she received from the environmental justice team did include notifications when anything was coming offline for maintenance or repair in order to warn the community ahead of time.

- **Staff Revilla** commented that she was referring to the plant's ventilation.

**Member Pierce** responded that she would receive notices that the plant would have to vent when pressure built up or the fan was down.

- **Staff Revilla** shared an illustration and indicated the various points that the SFPUC would take measurements.
- **Member García** asked whether one of the schematics with a truck showed waste going in or waste going out.

**Staff Revilla** responded that it was waste going out from the truck and asked García if he was familiar with biosolids.

- **Member García** commented that it was the end state that would go out as fertilizer.

**Staff Revilla** responded that the end product dropped in the trucks was referred to as cake, and it has a good aroma, which is why it does need to go through the ammonia removal process with the biofilters. She added that it was also because it had a larger volume, so it was more diluted.

- **Member García** commented that he asked because he wanted to understand the layout of the facility.

**Staff Revilla** responded that the designers did a great job because the total amount of cfm (cubic feet per minute) for the whole facility is only 27,000 versus 91,000 from the Headworks Facility. She added that there were different sources and different types of processes considering that the Headworks Facility was bigger due to needing more space, but with biosolids, the volume was less than water.

Public Comment: None

## 6. Staff report

- Reminder that District 1, District 10, and the Engineering/Finance seats are vacant

Public Comment: None

## 7. Future Agenda Items and Resolutions

- Sewer Laterals - *tentatively March*
- SF Estuary Institute – *tentatively March or for the Full CAC*
- Wastewater Emergency Notification and Communication
- Westside Water Resources Presentation
- Green Infrastructure Grant Reform
- Air Quality: Future Odor Control Systems for Headworks and Biosolids Update – *tentatively May*
- Level of Service Goals Update and Annual Report – *tentatively*
- Upper Islais Creed Watershed Approach Update – *tentatively 2023*
- Wastewater Enterprise Competency Based Training System Update – *tentatively 2023*
- Regulation and Legislation for PFAS, Microplastics, and BPA
- Floodwater Grant Program
- Treasure Island and Wastewater
- Southeast Treatment Plant Update
- Watershed Stewardship Grants
- Next Generation Green Infrastructure
- Racial Equity Plan – Funding to Support the Plan
- Job Creation at the Plant – City Works and Apprenticeship Program
- Wastewater CAC staff
- Asset Management Integration – policy and capital projects
- Green Infrastructure Program and Resolution Update
- Wastewater Communications Update
- Stormwater Management Ordinance and Southeast Treatment Plant
- Upcoming Construction
- Workforce Programs and Qualifications
- Treasure Island Field Trip
- Environmental Justice Analysis briefing
- Environmental Justice in Capital Projects

### Adopted Resolutions for Follow Up

- Resolution in Support of SFPUC Class A Biosolids Local Distribution Program [adopted August 21, 2018](#)
- Resolution in Support of Cityworks Interns Recommendations [adopted on November 21, 2017](#)
- Resolution in Support of Equitable Green Infrastructure Implementation throughout the Southeast Sector of San Francisco and throughout the City [adopted on June 20, 2017](#)
- Resolution Urging SFPUC Commission to Initiate Planning and Environmental Review for Building a New Community Center at Third and Evans and to Direct Staff to Develop an Interim Greenhouse Environmental and Workforce Development Program [adopted on October 18, 2016](#)
- Resolution Supporting the SFPUC to Conduct Robust Community Engagement to Determine the Community's Preference for Remodeling Southeast Community Facility at 1800 Oakdale or Building a New Community Center at 1550 Evans [adopted on January 19, 2016](#)

Public Comment:

- **Susan Hinton** commented that she lives in Santa Clara, which is one of the cities that the SFPUC has a memorandum of understanding with. She added that she is interested in wastewater issues and noted how Valley Water sent out an email with a map that indicated possible areas that could flood. Hinton commented that she did not find the email to be helpful and came across a separate URL, [alert.valleywater.org](http://alert.valleywater.org), for Valley Water. She added that it included a mobile phone app that showed current stream, reservoir, and rainfall information. Hinton noted that phones are a better way to alert people, and there are already similar systems such as the USGS (United States Geological Survey) mobile site. She added that if sensors could be placed and data could be centralized, then that information could be used to create an app for people to tap into. Hinton provided a link for the older Valley Water mobile alert app <https://valleywateralert.org/dwmobile/index.php>, a link that merges USGS sensor information better than the older mobile app <https://alert.valleywater.org/map?p=map>, and a USGS mobile water sensor app link <https://m.waterdata.usgs.gov>.
- **Member Jacuzzi** commented that regarding flooding on the West side, it can be easily fixed by using the sand that goes 800 feet down into the basin, and signs would not be needed then.

8. **Announcements/Comments** Visit [www.sfpuc.org/cac](http://www.sfpuc.org/cac) for final confirmation of the next meeting date.

Public Comment: None

## 9. **Adjournment**

Motion was made (Nagengast) and seconded (Jacuzzi) to adjourn the meeting.

Meeting was adjourned at 7:10 pm.