



**San Francisco Public Utilities Commission  
 Citizens' Advisory Committee  
 Wastewater Subcommittee**

**MEETING MINUTES**

**Tuesday, July 11, 2023  
 5:30 p.m. – 7:00 p.m.**

**525 Golden Gate Avenue, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Tuolumne Conference Room**

Please be advised that Members of the SFPUC CAC will attend this meeting in-person. Members of the public are invited to observe the meeting in-person or remotely online as described below. Members of the public attending the meeting in person will have an opportunity to provide public comment on every item. In addition to in-person public comment, the SFPUC CAC will hear remote public comment on each agenda item.

**Meeting URL**

<https://sfwater.zoom.us/j/84922049933?pwd=NEsyamdjK2Vpcm9GeTczenFJVIE0UT09>

**Phone Dial-in**

669.219.2599

Find your local number: <https://sfwater.zoom.us/u/kolNZGz3v>

**Meeting ID / Passcode**

849 2204 9933 / 891470

**Mission:** The Wastewater Subcommittee shall review sewage and stormwater collection, treatment, and disposal system replacement, recycling, and other relevant plans, programs, and policies ([Admin. Code Article XV, Sections 5.140 - 5.142](#)).

**Members**

<b>Amy Nagengast, Chair (D8)</b>	Maika Pinkston (M-Enviro. Org)	Michelle Pierce (B-Enviro. Justice)
Douglas Jacuzzi (D4)	Moisés García (D9)	Andrea Baker (B-Small Business)
Steven Lee (D10)		

**D = District Supervisor appointed, M = Mayoral appointed, B = Board President appointed**

**Staff Liaisons:** Mayara Ruski Augusto Sa, Lexus Moncrease and Jotti Aulakh  
 Staff Email for Public Comment: [cac@sfwater.org](mailto:cac@sfwater.org)

**ORDER OF BUSINESS**

**1. Call to order and roll call at 5:30 pm**

Members present at roll call: (4) Nagengast, Jacuzzi, García, and Baker

Members Absent: (3) Lee, Pierce, and Pinkston

**OUR MISSION:** To provide our customers with high-quality, efficient, and reliable water, power and sewer services in a manner that values environmental and community interests and sustains the resources entrusted to our care.

**London N. Breed**  
Mayor

**Newsha Ajami**  
President

**Sophie Maxwell**  
Vice President

**Tim Paulson**  
Commissioner

**Tony Rivera**  
Commissioner

**Kate Stacy**  
Commissioner

**Dennis J. Herrera**  
General Manager



Staff: Michael Tran, Jignesh Desai, Anna Roche, Kristen Webb, Craig Freeman, Elsa Eder, Chris Colwick, and Idil Bereket

Members of the Public: None

**2. Approve [May 9, 2023 Minutes](#)**

Motion was made (García) and seconded (Jacuzzi) to approve the May 9, 2023, Minutes as amended for which Chair Nagengast provided an edited version of the Chair's Report

AYES: (4) Nagengast, Jacuzzi, García, and Baker

NOES: (0)

ABSENT: ( ) Lee, Pierce, and Baker

•

Public Comment: None

**3. Report from the Chair**

- Welcome members, staff, and the public
- **Chair Nagengast** noted that with the new stormwater charge, a property owner can assess their parcel's rate.

Public Comment: None

**4. Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda

Public Comment: None

**5. Presentation and Discussion: [Ocean Beach Climate Adaptation Plan Update](#), Anna Roche, Project Manager, SFPUC Project Management Bureau**

*Presentation*

- Ocean Beach Climate Change Adaptation: Long-term Improvements CCSF Project – SFPUC Lead Agency
- Agenda
- Project History
- Historic Approaches to Erosion
- Project Drivers: Infrastructure at Risk
- Short-term & ACOE Sand Placement
- Short-term Improvements
- ACOE Sand Placement
- Long-term Improvements: Transition from 65% to 95% Design
- Project Elements
- Major Changes from 65% to 95%
- Low Profile Wall

- Low Profile Wall Design Layout
- DSM at Northern Wall Terminus
- SFPUC Access Road & Bike Path
- PUC Access Road & Bike Path
- Coastal Trail & Stairs to Beach
- Coastal Trail Overview
- Coastal Trail
- Stairs to Beach
- Public Restroom
- Intersection Improvements & Coastal Parking Lot
- Intersection Improvements at Sloat
- Intersection Improvements at Skyline
- Zoo Access
- New Access to Zoo Parking Lot
- ADA Beach Access Updates
- ADA Design Updates
- Stormwater Control & Dune Mitigation
- Stormwater Infiltration Basins
- Infiltration Basins
- Dune Mitigation
- Art Installation
- Art Installation Updates
- Environmental Updates
- CEQA & NEPA
- Additional Significant Impacts
- Additional NEPA for WIFIA Funding
- Resource Agency Coordination
- Project R-O-W Agreements
- Right-of-Way
- Schedule
- Ocean Beach Project Schedule
- Ocean Beach Contracts Schedule
- Remaining Challenges
- Ongoing Challenges

*Discussion*

- **Member García** asked if the ACOE (Army Corps of Engineers) sand placement was when the ACOE dredged below the Golden Gate Bridge.

**Staff Roche** responded affirmatively.

- **Member Jacuzzi** asked if that was done with pumping.

**Staff Roche** responded affirmatively.

- **Member Jacuzzi** asked if this process was cheaper than trucking the sand.

**Staff Roche** responded affirmatively and noted that the SFPUC cost shares the incremental increase that it costs the ACOE to place the sand onshore instead of offshore. She added that it was a \$7 million incremental increase of which the SFPUC pays 35% of.

- **Member Baker** asked if the beach was accessible to those who have mobility issues.

**Staff Roche** responded affirmatively. She commented that the SFPUC will make surface improvements to make sure the path is adequate for wheelchair users. She added that they are working with San Francisco Recreation and Parks (Rec and Park) to provide Mobi-mats (portable non-slip wheelchair access mat) at Taraval Street for beach access.

- **Member García** asked where the parking lot will be moved in the image displayed on slide 21.

**Staff Roche** responded that there was a parking lot at the northern and southern end of the Coastal Trail, but the parking lot on the southern end was no longer there due to erosion. She added that there were 30 spots remaining on the northern end and the remaining parking spots will be moved further south to protect the coast.

- **Member Jacuzzi** asked if the Ocean Beach Climate Change Adaptation Project was intended to be ongoing.

**Staff Roche** responded affirmatively and noted that monitoring and sand nourishment will be a part of the SFPUC's operations and maintenance. She commented that the SFPUC had not yet completed their CDP (Coastal Development Permit) with the Coastal Commission, but they will be bringing in sand to the area in perpetuity.

- **Member Baker** asked how frequently sand would be brought in.

**Staff Roche** responded that it would depend on the weather but on average they would bring it in every three to five years.

- **Chair Nagengast** asked if there would be a changing room and separate shower.

**Staff Roche** responded that there will be a foot rinse on the outside similar to what already exists, and there will not be a changing room. She added that the bathrooms could be used for changing.

- **Member Jacuzzi** asked if there will be a traffic light.

**Staff Roche** responded affirmatively and noted there will be a new crosswalk for people to reach the Lake Merced area.

- **Chair Nagengast** asked who would be doing the operations and maintenance for the infiltration basins depicted on slide 26.

**Staff Roche** responded that the SFPUC was still working on that.

- **Chair Nagengast** asked if more staff hiring would be needed for the operations and maintenance.

**Staff Roche** responded that the SFPUC would use contractors because it would not be full time work.

- **Member Baker** asked what the name of the artist was.

**Staff Roche** responded that his first name was Mark, but she could not remember his last name and will follow up.

(Mark Baugh-Sasaki is the name of the artist)

- **Member Baker** asked what the overall budget of the project was.

**Staff Roche** responded that it was \$220 million.

- **Member Baker** asked if the project would end in 2033.

**Staff Roche** responded that construction would end in 2032.

- **Member Baker** asked when the SFPUC started planning the project.

**Staff Roche** responded that the project started with the completion of the Ocean Beach Master Plan in 2012.

- **Member García** asked who was leading the Supervisors' legislation.

**Staff Roche** responded that it was Rec and Park because the Great Highway is their asset.

- **Member García** asked if there would be pushback to the project considering people tried to pass Proposition I last year.

**Staff Roche** responded that the SFPUC believes people want this project because the ballot measures were unsuccessful. She added that people are contacting the SFPUC to complain but every project has people who will either support it or reject it. Staff Roche commented that this project was one of the first major decisions that the City made to address sea level rise.

- **Member García** commented that he brought this up because it could be an opportunity for the CAC to take a stance on the legislation.

**Staff Roche** responded that the Great Highway legislation will not be introduced until October, but the SFPUC is beginning to brief the Supervisors on it.

- **Member Jacuzzi** asked if there would be an effect on traffic with the possibility of the Great Highway becoming pedestrian only.

**Staff Roche** responded that all the traffic studies and CEQA (California Environmental Quality Act) analysis was already complete. She added that the SFPUC must consider other projects with varying timelines and noted that some of the final decisions are made once construction starts.

- **Member Jacuzzi** commented that there is a crosswalk with cars coming behind people.

**Staff Roche** responded that the big lift was on SFMTA (San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency) working on the timing of the lights and traffic sequencing.

Public Comment: None

6. **Presentation and Discussion:** [Overview of Treasure Island Wastewater Operations & Systems](#), Michael Tran P.E., Engineering Section Manager, Collection System Division, SFPUC Wastewater Enterprise

*Presentation*

- Treasure Island & Yerba Buena Island Collection System Overview
- Agenda
- SF's Combined Sewer System Treatment Facilities
- SF's Combined Sewer System Collection System
- Comparison of Combined Sewer System & Municipally Separate Storm Sewer Systems
- Redevelopment in San Francisco
- Treasure Island & Yerba Buena Island Redevelopment Overview
- Treasure Island & Yerba Buena Island Existing MS4 Collection System Sanitary Sewer
- Treasure Island & Yerba Buena Island Future MS4 Collection System Sanitary Sewer
- Treasure Island & Yerba Buena Island Existing MS4 Collection System Storm Drain
- Treasure Island & Yerba Buena Island Future MS4 Collection System Storm Drain
- Treasure Island Future Collection System Stormwater Treatment Facilities

*Discussion*

- **Member Jacuzzi** asked if the wetland areas depicted on slide 13 would receive the treated stormwater.

**Staff Tran** responded that some of that would go to green infrastructure, which will provide some sort of treatment.

- **Member Jacuzzi** asked if that stormwater would be pre-treated or would it go directly to green infrastructure.

**Staff Freeman** responded that the image depicted on slide 1 was a centralized green infrastructure facility for the stormwater to go through and come out clean the other end before it runs to the bay. He commented that the stormwater runs through gravity into the facility and because Treasure Island (TI) is flat, that stormwater is lifted with a small pump and then runs to the bay by gravity.

- **Chair Nagengast** asked how the TI and Yerba Buena Island (YBI) operations were affected by the power outages.

**Staff Tran** responded that regarding the pump stations for the Wastewater Enterprise, the SFPUC deploys crews with temporary

generators while the troubleshoot occurs. He commented that the SFPUC was working with TIDA to provide them with their in-house expertise to identify solutions to help mitigate the amount of power outages for the systems. Staff Tran added that it is a question of how much money the SFPUC wants to invest on infrastructure that is falling apart until it is fully redeveloped and take into consideration the overall cost-benefit of installing a generator onsite.

**Staff Freeman** responded that the island is getting a new power grid in the future, and all the redevelopment sites where the SFPUC is replacing pump stations have a performance threshold for the SFPUC to determine when to install dedicated stand-by power. He commented that if a pump station going down results in a permit violation, which is a threat to human health, then there should be backup power there. Staff Freeman noted that if a pump station goes down, but the service can float down the street to the next pump station, then there would be no need for dedicated power there. He added that because TI has a separate sewer system with no backup capacity, almost all the pump stations have dedicated stand-by power.

**Staff Desai** responded that the Treasure Island Water Resource Recovery Facility will have two stand-by emergency generators onsite to continue processing the flows that come from collection systems.

Public Comment: None

7. **Presentation and Discussion:** [DB-132 Treasure Island Water Resource Recovery Facility \(TIWRRF\)](#), Jignesh Desai, Senior Project Manager, SFPUC Project Management Bureau

*Presentation*

- DB-132 Treasure Island Water Resource Recovery Facility (TIWRRF)
- Agenda
- Project Objective
- Site Map
- Project Overview
- Site Layout
- Rendering of TIWRRF
- Wastewater Collection System
- Design-Build Approach
- Project Schedule and Project

*Discussion*

- **Chair Nagengast** asked if there was an existing treatment plant on TI that SFPUC operates as part of the collection system.

**Staff Desai** responded affirmatively.

- **Member Baker** asked what the life expectancy was for a treatment plant.

**Staff Desai** responded that wastewater treatment plants are heavy on electrical and chemical components, which last 25 years, while concrete that is coated can last 50 years.

- **Member Baker** asked what the maximum capacity was for the current system being designed.

**Staff Desai** responded that it could handle 1.3 million gallons per day with some additional flexibility to handle 10 to 20% extra flow. He commented that the SFPUC has also considered that additional housing units could be added, so they have a building plan that can absorb such an increase.

- **Chair Nagengast** asked how tall the odor biological tanks were and if it would be difficult to bring them onto the island.

**Staff Desai** responded that they are about 30 to 35 feet tall and can be brought easily onto the island through the entrance and exit areas.

Public Comment: None

## 8. Staff Report

No report from Staff.

Public Comment: None

## 9. Future Agenda Items and Resolutions

- Resolution to support Great Highway Closure – *tentatively September*
- Next Generation Green Infrastructure – *tentatively September*
- Green infrastructure Grants Reform
- Westside Water Resources Presentation (Member Jacuzzi)
- WW Southeast Air Quality Presentation – *Tentatively May*
- WW Emergency Notification and Communication
- Stormwater Management Ordinance and Southeast Treatment Plant
- Upper Islais Creed Watershed Approach Update – *Tentative*
- Level of Service Goals Update and Annual Report – *Tentative*
- Wastewater Enterprise Competency Based Training System Update
- Regulation and Legislation for PFAS, Microplastics, and BPA
- Floodwater Grant Program
- Treasure Island and Wastewater
- Watershed Stewardship Grants
- Racial Equity Plan – Funding to Support the Plan
- Job Creation at the Plant – City Works and Apprenticeship Program
- Wastewater CAC staff
- Asset Management Integration – policy and capital projects
- Wastewater Communications Update
- Upcoming Construction
- Workforce Programs and Qualifications
- Treasure Island Field Trip
- Environmental Justice Analysis briefing
- Environmental Justice in Capital Projects

Adopted Resolutions for Follow Up

- Resolution in Support of SFPUC Class A Biosolids Local Distribution Program [adopted August 21, 2018](#)

- Resolution in Support of Cityworks Interns Recommendations [adopted on November 21, 2017](#)
- Resolution in Support of Equitable Green Infrastructure Implementation throughout the Southeast Sector of San Francisco and throughout the City [adopted on June 20, 2017](#)
- Resolution Urging SFPUC Commission to Initiate Planning and Environmental Review for Building a New Community Center at Third and Evans and to Direct Staff to Develop an Interim Greenhouse Environmental and Workforce Development Program [adopted on October 18, 2016](#)
- Resolution Supporting the SFPUC to Conduct Robust Community Engagement to Determine the Community's Preference for Remodeling Southeast Community Facility at 1800 Oakdale or Building a New Community Center at 1550 Evans [adopted on January 19, 2016](#)

Public Comment: None

- 10. Announcements/Comments** Visit [www.sfpuc.org/cac](http://www.sfpuc.org/cac) for final confirmation of the next meeting date.

Public Comment: None

#### **11. Adjournment**

Motion was made (Nagengast) and seconded (Jacuzzi) to adjourn the meeting.

Meeting was adjourned at 7:12 pm.