

**San Francisco Public Utilities Commission
Citizens' Advisory Committee**

MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, April 17, 2018

5:30 p.m. – 7:00 p.m.

525 Golden Gate Ave., 3rd Floor Tuolumne Conference Room

Mission: The purpose of the SFPUC CAC is to provide recommendations to the SFPUC General Manager, the SFPUC Commission, and the Board of Supervisors regarding the agency's long-term strategic, financial, and capital improvement plans ([Admin Code 5.140-142](#)).

Members:

Amy Zock, Chair (D3)

Wendy Aragon (D1)

Suki Kott (D2)

Jim McHugh (D4)

Ted Loewenberg (D5)

Matthew Steen (D6)

Jasmine Conrad (D7)

Amy Nagengast (D8)

Ernesto Martinez (D9)

Anietie Ekanem (D10)

Jennifer Clary (D11)

Maggie Thomas (M-
Env.Group)

Nicole Sandkulla (M-Reg'l Water
Customers)

Mark Tang (M-Eng./Financial)

Nathaniel Kinsey (M-Lg Water User)

Owen O'Donnell (B-Small Business)

Misty McKinney (B-Env Justice)

M = Mayoral appointment, B = Board President Appointment

Staff Liaisons: Tracy Zhu, Alexandra Johnson

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. **Call to order and roll call:** The meeting was called to order at 6:01pm.

Members present at roll call: (9) Aragon, McHugh, Lowenberg, Steen, Ekanem, Clary, Thomas, O'Donnell, McKinney

Members absent at roll call: (8) Zock, Kott, Conrad, Nagengast, Martinez, Sandkulla, Tang, Kinsey

Members of the public: (1) Laura Feinstein

2. **Approve [March 20, 2018](#) Meeting Minutes**

Motion was made (Clary) and seconded (Aragon) to approve the [March 20, 2018](#) Meeting Minutes

AYES: (9) Aragon, McHugh, Lowenberg, Steen, Ekanem, Clary, Thomas, O'Donnell, McKinney

NOES: (0)

ABSENT: (8) Zock, Kott, Conrad, Nagengast, Martinez, Sandkulla, Tang, Kinsey

Mark Farrell
Mayor

Ike Kwon
President

Vince Courtney
Vice President

Ann Moller Caen
Commissioner

Francesca Vietor
Commissioner

Anson Moran
Commissioner

Harlan L. Kelly, Jr.
General Manager



3. **Report from the Chair** - Chair
 - Welcome members of the public and staff
4. **Public Comment:** None.
5. **Presentation and Discussion:** [Ratepayer Affordability](#), Simone Hudson, Budget and Contract Analyst, Community Benefits and John Scarpulla, Local Policy Manager, Policy and Government Affairs

Presentation Topics

- Ratepayer Affordability
- Affordability Project Context
- Existing Affordability Metric
- Affordability Project Goals
- Affordability: Single Family Residential Assistance
- Guiding Questions
- Enrolled **Customer Assistance Program (CAP)** Customers
- CAP-Eligible Customer Base
- CAP-Eligible Customer Base
- Water Cost Burdened Customer Base
- Water Cost Burdened Customer Base
- Notes on reading these charts
- WCB HH Are Predominantly 1-3 ppl HH
- WCB HHs Are Predominantly Families and Female-led Households
- Far Greater Share of Female-led WCB Households Than Non-WCB HHs
- Almost a ¼ of WCB Households Are Linguistically Isolated
- Personal-level Analysis
- Nearly ¼ of Residents in Burdened Households are Over 65
- Race Is a Key Indicator for Burdened Households
- The Southeast Area Has A Higher Rate of Burdened Households
- WCB vs. CAP-Eligible Households
- Key Takeaways
- Next Steps: Single Family Residential Assistance
- Affordability: Fees & Shutoffs Fees Impacting Low-Income Customers
- Timeline for SFPUC Shutoff Procedures
- Shutoff Data: Fiscal Year 16-17
- Water Shutoffs, FY 2016-17
- Staff Proposal
- Affordability Project Goals
- Discussion

Discussion Topics

- *Member Thomas* asked if the presenters have considered text message reminders for bill payments.
Staff Scarpulla mentioned that he would have to confirm with the Customer Service Department on how they do their outreach.
- *Member Thomas* asked how is the 200% below the Federal Poverty Line (FPL) determined.
Staff Hudson informed the FPL is widely used but they are working on integrating a tiered approach to increase enrollment.
- *Member McKinney* asked what the main reason is for individuals who had their services shut off and chose not to respond.
Staff Scarpulla informed that although there is a lot of data about the person i.e. age, location etc. there isn't much information on why or why not they choose to respond.

- *Member Ekanem* commented that it would be interesting to see the data on people who repeatedly receive 48hour notices. He then mentioned that median income for some residents in District 10 is roughly \$29K so budgeting for these residents isn't likely due to lack of financial knowledge but competing necessities (i.e. food, shelter).
- *Member Clary* asked what the budget would be for 1,200 CAP customers, for 26,000 CAP customers and how many customers can the current budget serve.
Staff Hudson informed that the budget for 1,200 CAP customers is \$400K, for 26,000 CAP customers is \$8M.
- *Member Loewenberg* asked what the funding sources are for CAP.
Staff Hudson informed that CAP is funded through a few non-rate revenue sources (e.g. side rental income, unclaimed funds from closed accounts). *Staff Scarpulla* mentioned the SFPUC are looking into using funds from the utility tax.
- *Member Clary* asked if CAP is subject to the Municipal Utility District (MUD) Act which includes tenant protections.
Staff Scarpulla mentioned that he would follow-up on whether the MUD Act is enforced. SFPUC does post bill notices to individual tenants and give them the opportunity to call Customer Service.
 - *Member Loewenberg* asked if SFPUC maps postings to single or multifamily residences. *Staff Scarpulla* mentioned it's safe to assume there are tenants in multifamily units. Tenants are also likely in single family houses that aren't lean eligible.
- *Member Steen* commented that there hasn't been aggressive outreach to enroll CAP eligible households.
Staff Hudson agreed that outreach is an area of growth.
 - *Member Loewenberg* mentioned that the CAC previously crafted a Resolution for an app to do increase outreach with the agency's customer base.
 - *Member Aragon* suggested advertising on buses, libraries and recreational centers.

Public Comment: None

6. **Presentation and Discussion: [California Policy Challenges and Opportunities on Water Affordability](#)**, Laura Feinstein, Senior Research Associate, Pacific Institute

Presentation Topics

- What Is Affordable Water and Sanitation?
- Why Is Water Becoming More Unaffordable?
- State Initiatives on Affordability
- Local Strategies on Affordability
- Get Involved With Statewide Processes
- Bay Area Has Unique Affordability Concerns
- Conclusions
- My Questions For You
- Questions?

Discussion Topics

- *Member O'Donnell* commented that Federal Government subsidizes farmers and should consider funding residents.
- *Member Clary* asked how many utilities and/or Californians are covered by a low income assistance program.

Ms. Feinstein stated there is a way to calculate that number in the Electronic Annual Reports to the Water Board. She mentioned that most utilities have low enrollment rates.

Public Comment: None

7. Discussion: CAC Member Backgrounds and Interests, Chair Amy Zock

Agenda Item tabled for next FULL CAC Meeting due to time constraint.

8. Staff Report

- Hetch Hetchy Tour dates
 - i. Option 1: May 16-17
 - ii. Option 2: May 30-31 [FILLED]
 - iii. Option 3: August 15-16

9. Future Agenda Items and Resolutions

- Education Initiatives (tentative May)
- Human Resources
- Strategic Plan Update
- Contracting Process
- Communications/ Website Redesign
- Water Equity and Water Access for Homeless
- Workforce Programs
- Agency-wide Planning on Climate Change and Climate Adaptation Planning
- Water Rights and Raker Act
- Water Use and Parks
- Flooding Protection
- Southeast Community Facility
- Water Quality Report

10. Announcements/Comments – The next meeting for the Full CAC will be on May 15, 2018. Check www.sfwater.org/cac for the next scheduled meeting.

- Wendy Aragon's is being acknowledged for her four years of service as CAC Chair on April 24, 2018 from 1:30pm – 3:30pm at the SFPUC Commission Meeting in City Hall.

11. Adjournment

Motion was made (Clary) and seconded (Loewenberg) to adjourn the meeting.

Meeting was adjourned at 7:10pm.