



**San Francisco Public Utilities Commission
 Citizens' Advisory Committee**

MEETING MINUTES

**Tuesday, September 21, 2021
 5:30 p.m. – 7:00 p.m.**

PARTICIPATE VIA BLUEJEANS VIRTUAL CONFERENCE SOFTWARE

Meeting URL

<https://bluejeans.com/630362454/2974>

Phone Dial-in

408.317.9253

Meeting ID / Participant Passcode

630 362 454# / 2974

This meeting is being held by Teleconference Pursuant to the Governor's Executive Order N-29-20 and the Sixteenth Supplement to Mayoral Proclamation Declaring the Existence of a Local Emergency Dated February 25,2020

During the Coronavirus Disease (COVID-19) emergency, the San Francisco Public Utilities Citizens Advisory Committee's (SFPUC CAC) regular meeting room, 525 Golden Gate Ave., 3rd Floor Tuolumne Conference Room, is closed. CAC Members and SFPUC staff will convene CAC meetings remotely by teleconference. Members of the public are encouraged to submit their public comment on agenda items in advance of the teleconference meeting by emailing comments to cac@sfgwater.org. Comments submitted no later than 12 PM Tuesday the day of the meeting will be read into the record by SFPUC CAC Staffing Team members during the teleconference meeting and will be treated as a substitute to providing public comment during the meeting. Persons who submit written public comment in advance on an agenda item or items will not be permitted to also provide public comment on the same agenda item(s) during the meeting.

Mission: The purpose of the SFPUC CAC is to provide recommendations to the SFPUC General Manager, the SFPUC Commission, and the Board of Supervisors regarding the agency's long-term strategic, financial, and capital improvement plans ([Admin. Code Article XV, Sections 5.140 - 5.142](#)).

Members:

Anietie Ekanem, Chair (D10)

- Marria Evbuoma (D1)
- Suki Kott (D2)
- Steven Kight (D3)
- VACANT (D4)
- Emily Algire (D5)
- Barklee Sanders (D6)
- VACANT (D7)
- Amy Nagengast (D8)

- Moisés García (D9)
- Jennifer Clary (D11)
- Maika Pinkston (M-Environmental Org.)
- Nicole Sandkulla (M-Regional Water Customers)
- VACANT (M-Engineering/Financial)
- Eliahu Perszyk (M-Large Water User)
- VACANT (B-Small Business)
- Michelle Pierce (B-Environmental Justice)

London N. Breed
 Mayor

Sophie Maxwell
 President

Anson Moran
 Vice President

Tim Paulson
 Commissioner

Ed Harrington
 Commissioner

Newsha Ajami
 Commissioner

Michael Carlin
 Acting
 General Manager

OUR MISSION: To provide our customers with high-quality, efficient and reliable water, power and sewer services in a manner that values environmental and community interests and sustains the resources entrusted to our care.



D = District Supervisor appointed, M = Mayor appointed, B = Board President appointed

Staff Liaisons: Mayara Ruski Augusto Sa and Jobanjot Aulakh

Staff Email for Public Comment: cac@sfwater.org

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. Call to order and roll call at 5:37pm

Members present at roll call: (10) Ekanem, Kott, Kight, Algire, Sanders, García, Clary, Sandkulla, Perszyk, Pierce

Members Absent: (3) Evbuoma, Nagengast, Pinkston

Members of the Public: Joshua Ochoa

Public Comment: None

*Member Sandkulla left at 7:10 pm. Quorum maintained.

2. Approve [August 17, 2021](#) Minutes

Motion was made (Kott) and seconded (Clary) to approve the August 17, 2021 Minutes.

AYES: (10) Ekanem, Kott, Kight, Algire, Sanders, García, Clary, Sandkulla, Perszyk, Pierce

NOES: (0)

ABSENT: (3) Evbuoma, Nagengast, Pinkston

Public Comment: None

3. Report from the Chair

- Welcome members, staff, and the public
- Welcome and introduction of new member, District 6 representative Barklee Sanders
- Mentor/Mentee Program

Public Comment: Joshua Ochoa, who is hoping to be the D7 representative, introduced himself.

4. Public Comment: Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda

Public Comment: None

5. **Presentation and Discussion:** [Annual CAC Survey Results Summary](#),
Mayara Ruski Augusto Sa, Public Records and Stakeholder Manager, External
Affairs (10 minute presentation, 10-15 minute discussion)

Presentation

- Mission of the CAC
- Member Survey: 9 Respondents
- Member Statistics
- Members Join for Different Reasons
- Members hear about CAC openings through various avenues
- Broad Range of Skills and Talent
- Strong Organizational Representation
- The CAC Reaches Greater Community
- CAC Members' Interactions Community
- Demographics – 9 Respondents
- CAC Members Feel Supported By...
- CAC Members Feel Supported, Recognized, & Respected
- CAC Member Preparedness & Empowerment
- Alignment of CAC & SFPUC
- Members Perception of SFPUC
- FY 2020-2021 Favorite Topics
- Reasons Behind Chosen Favorite Topics
- FY 2020-2021 Topics Aligned with Members' Personal Priorities
- Suggested Priorities FY 2021-2022
- Topics, Actions, Resolutions, and/or Trainings to be Facilitated by the Members
- Trainings and Tours for FY 2021-2022
- FY 2020-2021 Improvements and Challenges
- FY 2020-2021 Accomplishments

Discussion

- **Chair Ekanem** commented it would be interesting to advertise our meetings to the organizations that the CAC members are associated with.
- **Member Clary** commented that last year's survey is not available because the website has been updated. Clary then asked if old links will be transferred to new website.

Staff Sa responded that she was not planning on posting the survey due to the amount of personal information.

Member Clary commented that the survey for 2014, 2015, and 2016 are posted and the CAC should deliberate if it should be posted or not. Clary also commented that the CAC is becoming less diverse and I would be good to get data on that.

Staff Sa replied that the survey results can be posted if that is preferred.

Member Algire commented that she would also love to see previous survey responses if possible.

Member Clary commented the difficulty is that it is legally public information. If we want to keep that information private, we probably should not include those survey questions.

Member García commented it will be linked in our minutes, as it was done in the past.

Member Clary added that the links prior to the website transition are no longer available.

Staff Sa commented that she would review what is published on SFPUC's new website.

- **Chair Ekanem** asked how we can get more people from the public to join our meetings.

Member Sanders replied that he raises awareness by using Facebook or Instagram advertisements, Nextdoor alerts, Mailchimp to build email lists, and Google Voice to gather numbers. Depending on the event or impact of it, he will put flyers around Treasure Island or go door to door and gather volunteers.

Staff Sa commented that the agenda is sent to a fair amount of people. The agenda is sent to the CAC members, staff, and anyone that has requested that the agenda be sent to them. If there are other members of the public that could benefit or would join the meeting if they received the agenda, their contact information can be sent to Mayara and she will add them to mailing list.

Chair Ekanem questioned if the agendas are appealing enough. He then asked if the agenda is enough and if it compels non-CAC members to come to the meetings.

Member Sanders recommended including any materials that will be shared and suggested following up with people that made public comments.

- **Member García** suggested adding a direct link to the agenda that does not require click on more things to get to the actual agenda. García suggested adding the text of the agenda in the body of the email.

Staff Sa replied that the email has both "review the agenda materials here," which takes people to the CAC landing page and "view the agenda" button that directs people to the actual agenda.

Member García clarified that his suggestion is to add the text of the agenda to the body of the email.

Staff Sa replied she will add the text of the agenda to future emails.

- **Member Clary** commented that it is helpful to forward the information being covered to people that care about the specific subjects. Clary then asked if the agendas could be published earlier, at least a week ahead of each meeting.

Staff Sa replied that she can work on that.

- **Chair Ekanem** asked if people feel comfortable sending the agendas to their own networks with a blurb.

Member Algire commented that getting the agendas out earlier would help generating interest.

Member Pierce agreed and said that she knows people that would like to attend the meetings.

Member Algire commented that she knows people who are interested in Water and Wastewater and plans on sharing future agendas with them

- **Member Clary** commented that, in terms of the design of the agenda, Member Sandkulla's predecessor had asked the Water Subcommittee to phrase the agenda items in terms of the desired outcome. This would help to draw attention to this topic.

Member Sandkulla replied that is something that BAWSCA routinely does for their Board Policy Committee

Chair Ekanem commented that this is a good idea.

Member Sanders asked if people could connect offline and if it is okay to share links with people to explain the situation in Treasure Island. Sanders concern is how to talk about issues in a controlled way, and if discussions should take place only during the meetings or if offline communications are allowed.

Staff Sa replied that communication between all the members should happen during the meetings. Topics to be discussed amongst all members should be agendaized and be discussed during the meetings to avoid violating the Brown Act. Members can connect with other members. However, if there is quorum and the discussion happens outside of a noticed meeting, that would violate the Brown Act. If there is a Treasure Island Citizens' Advisory Board meeting coming up that members would like to share with all the CAC members, the announcements section of the agenda can be used for that purpose. Or the information can be sent to staff and they will route that to all members.

Member García commented that Member Sanders has been assigned to the power subcommittee and he will reach out to schedule an individual check-in.

Members Sanders responded that it all sounds good and added that he wants to focus on other issues as well, not just Treasure Island.

- **Member Sanders** asked what the rules are to document sharing and can and cannot be shared.

Staff Sa replied that communications and documents sent or received as a member of the CAC can be subject to a public records request.

- **Member Clary** asked if new members get instructions on the Sunshine Ordinance and the Brown Act, so they understand the applicable rules.

Staff Sa answered positively. New members receive a welcome letter that contains an onboarding folder that cover the Brown Act, the Sunshine Ordinance, and Robert's Rules of Order.

Member Clary asked if that means that members are not expected to read the onboarding packet.

Staff Sa replied that members are expected to read the materials in the onboarding packet, but not the entire Brown Act and the Sunshine Ordinance.

- **Member Sandkulla** asked if CAC members are required to do AB 1234 ethics training.

Member Clary replied that CAC members have done in the past, but not in the last several years.

Member García commented that the trainings were optional and members that would like to do it, could sign up for it, but they never received a link.

- **Member Clary** commented that given the City Attorney has been activated to criticize the way the CAC writes its resolutions; they should probably administer Ethics and Sunshine training.

Member Sandkulla agreed and added that the new members need the appropriate training. There is an expectation of how public business is conducted.

Staff Sa commented that she will look into this and share information about available trainings.

Member Clary commented the City Attorney's Office can show up virtually to talk to the CAC members.

Member Kott commented they have done it in the past.

Member Clary replied affirmatively.

- **Chair Ekanem** thanked Member Sanders for taking up a specific topic and being willing to share it with the CAC. It is highly desirable to have individuals being able to take on a topic and bring it to their subcommittee or the full CAC.

Public Comment: Joshua Ochoa commented social media updates and report backs to the organizations work to obtain more public comment.

6. Discussion Only: SFPUC CAC Priorities for Fiscal Year 2021-2022, Anietie Ekanem, Full CAC Chair (30 minute discussion)

Introduction

- The members discussed the Full CAC and Subcommittee priorities for Fiscal Year 2021-2022. The Chairs will work on compiling each committee or subcommittee priorities.

Discussion

- **Staff Sa** commented this is meant to be an open discussion. Chair Ekanem will be reporting to the Commission on October 12, 2021, which is a good opportunity to voice the CAC's priorities to the Commission, the PUC, and members of the public.

- **Chair Ekanem** commented that this approach is to allow all members to chime in.
- **Member Sa** commented that she will remove “Recruit a Treasure Island Resident to Join the Power Subcommittee” from last year’s priorities since Member Sanders has joined us.

Chair Ekanem suggested striking through instead of removing it for now.

Member Kott suggested combining “Increase Workforce Equity” with workforce development.

Member Clary suggested keeping the two things separate.

Member Kott added she would like to know what the plan is for bringing in new employees.

Member Clary commented that the retirement is an opportunity to increase diversity. “Onboarding Diverse Workforce” was added as a Full CAC Priority

- **Member Clary** commented that the CAC is transitioning to educating the staff and the public about the urgency of diversifying our water supply. Clary added that diverse water supply is still a priority.
- **Member Sandkulla** commented that the priority that is missing is resilience.
- **Member Sanders** commented that Treasure Island should have the same number of outages as the rest of the City. It would be good to add urge investments on Treasure Island.
- **Chair Ekanem** commented that PG&E has been slowing growth in certain areas and it would be good to get a better understanding of what that correlation is and what that impact is and be able to track that.

Member García commented that there are interconnection issues and there will be a hearing about that at the Board of Supervisors at the end of this month.

- **Member Algire** commented that people would like a report on purchasing power lines from PG&E. There are a lot of unknowns around how it would impact jobs in the City for City workers, PG&E workers, and our local line workers, as well as the impact on rates.

Member García commented that we should hear more about PG&E assets at our October meeting.

Staff Sa corrected that the presentation on public power is scheduled for November.

- **Member García** suggested adding full electrification as a priority for the Power subcommittee. The IRPs (Integrated Resource Plans) are done every couple of years and it would be interesting to learn what is the impact if we need to electrify everything.

- **Chair Ekanem** commented that the CAC should also look into equitable electrification.
- **Member Sanders** suggested adding resiliency efforts related to Treasure Island.
- **Chair Ekanem** suggested adding jobs and the Social Impact Partnership Program as Wastewater priorities.

Member Pierce commented that she is worried about the Community Benefits team changes during transition of staff.

Staff Sa replied that the Environmental Justice positions are in the process of being filled, as well as the Social Impact Partnership manager position.

- **Chair Ekanem** suggested it would be good to prepare a scorecard to track growth and progress.

Member Kight and Sanders agreed with that suggestion.

Member García commented that it would be like a CAC grade chart.

Member Sandkulla commented that she likes the idea of a scorecard and suggested adding red, yellow, and green designations to actions.

Public Comment: Joshua Ochoa commented that scorecards would be great to track the progress that has been made.

7. **Presentation, Discussion and Possible Action:** [Resolution for Continued Support and Budget for SFPUC Racial Equity Plan and Community Benefits](#), Anietie Ekanem, Full CAC Chair (10 minute presentation, 10 minute discussion)

Brief Introduction by Chair Ekanem: This resolution is aimed to address concerns the CAC has that issued will get lost with leadership

Discussion

- **Chair Ekanem** explained that the idea behind this resolution is to make clear that the CAC supports the SFPUC's Racial Equity Plan.

Chair Ekanem suggested the following addition "RESOLVED, the SFPUC Citizens' Advisory Committee reiterates its strong support for the SFPUC's Racial Equity Plan" as the first resolved.

- **Member García** commented he could not find any statistics but would like to add one related to power.
- **Chair Ekanem** invited all members to provide additional feedback.
- **Member Clary** responded that asking that positions be filled in 60 days is not feasible. Clary suggested changing it to "as soon as possible."

Chair Ekanem agreed.

The second RESOLVED clause was changed to reflect that positions should be staffed "as soon as possible."

Chair Ekanem commented that positions are open and not always timely filled.

Member Kight commented that he agrees with Chair Ekanem and supports the idea of including a benchmark to ensure a successful implementation of the plans.

- **Member Kott** asked if the Civil Service Hiring Policies and Procedures hinder the development of diversity in City positions.

Member García replied that has been something that Justine Hinderliter mentioned when she presented to the CAC earlier this year.

Member Kott commented that it would desirable to urge the City to revamp the whole process because it is part of the reason why it has been difficult for the PUC to develop their workforce.

Chair Ekanem commented that the Racial Equity Plan outlines some steps to improve that process.

- **Member Sanders** asked if the benchmarking that was being discussed earlier would mean specifics in relation to what some the plans and resolutions cover. Sanders offered to provide some additional specifics about Treasure Island if appropriate.

Chair Ekanem replied that Treasure Island should probably have its own resolution.

- **Member Clary** commented that the hiring of Dennis Herrera is expected to take place at the next Commission meeting, and it would be great to have this resolution adopted prior to his onboarding.
- **Member Kight** suggested adding a provision asking the Commission to report back to the CAC to explain whether goals were met or not.

Chair Ekanem agreed with the suggestion.

Member Clary asked if the suggestion is to add a provision on regular report back to the Commission and the CAC.

Member Kight replied affirmatively. The idea is to hear back from the PUC or from the third-party in charge of implementing the plan.

Member Clary commented that this the resolution is directed at upper management and suggested limiting the report back requirement to the CAC and the Commission.

Chair Ekanem agreed with Member Clary.

The third RESOLVED clause was edited to include that monthly reports are due to both the Commission and the CAC.

Motion was made (Clary) and seconded (Kight) to adopt the resolution.

AYES: (9) Ekanem, Kott, Kight, Algire, Sanders, García, Clary, Perszyk, Pierce

NOES: (0)

ABSENT: (4) Evbuoma, Nagengast, Pinkston, Sandkulla

Public Comment: None

8. Staff Report

- Annual Report to the Commission – October 12, 2021
- Reminder for CAC seats seeking members
 - District 4
 - District 7
 - Small Business Seat appointed by Board of Supervisors' President
 - Engineering/Financial appointed by the Mayor
- The next Full CAC meeting will be a joint meeting with the Southeast Community Facility Commission on October 27, 2021

Public Comment: None

9. Future Agenda Items and Resolutions

- Public Power Expansion – *tentatively* November
- CleanPowerSF Update and DAC Sola Programs – *tentatively* November
- Treasure Island
- Racial Equity – Composition of the Management Team
- Power Rate Increases
- Education Update
- President Maxwell Visit
- Drought and Bay Delta Discussion
- CleanPowerSF and Hetch Hetchy Power Study Rates
- Agency-wide Planning & Policy on Climate Change & Adaptation
- Interagency Working Group on Sea Level Rise
- Contracting Process
- Education Resolution
- PUC Properties and City Department Partnerships
- Water Equity and Water Access for Homeless
- Workforce Programs
- Water Rights and Raker Act
- Water Use and Parks
- Flooding Protection
- Water Quality Report
- Green New Deal
- Micro Hydroelectric Power
- Prop A Bond Funding
- Commissioner Visits

Adopted Resolutions for Follow Up

- Resolution in Support of the Southern Skyline Boulevard Ridge Trail Extension project [adopted April 20, 2021](#)
- Resolution in Support of Interim Emergency Rate Assistance Program and Revised Community Assistance Program [adopted July 21, 2020](#)
- Resolution in Support of a Skilled and Diverse Utility Workforce [adopted February 19, 2019](#)
- Resolution Honoring the Life, Activism, and Contributions of Dr. Espanola Jackson to the Local Community [adopted on April 19, 2016](#)
- Resolution on Balboa Reservoir [adopted March 15, 2016](#)

Public Comment: None

10. Announcements/Comments The next scheduled meeting of the Full CAC will take place on October 27, 2021. Visit www.sfwater.org/cac for confirmation of the next scheduled meeting date.

- **Member Clary** commented that the Governor might approve an extension of the water shut off moratorium until the end of December. This will cover water and not wastewater.
- **Member García** commented that the SFPUC power moratorium does not expire until next March.

11. Adjournment

Motion was made (Ekanem) and seconded (Clary) to adjourn the meeting.

Meeting was adjourned at 7:29 pm