



1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36

**SAN FRANCISCO PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
RATE FAIRNESS BOARD
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**Minutes of Special Meeting
Tuesday, November 4, 2025, 10:00 AM – 12:00 PM**

Members of the Rate Fairness Board will attend this meeting in-person. Members of the public are invited to observe the meeting in-person or remotely online as described below. Members of the public attending the meeting in person or remotely online will have an opportunity to provide public comment on every item. It is possible that not every person in the queue will have an opportunity to provide remote public comment.

In-person Meeting: San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC), 525 Golden Gate Avenue, 2nd Floor, Yosemite Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

Virtually Via Zoom:

1. Modern Browser (WebRTC) [Best]

Please join with a modern browser such as Google Chrome or Microsoft Edge (no additional installation required)

2. Mobile Apple iOS or Android devices: Mobile users can also join with Zoom Cloud Meetings App on [Apple App Store](#) for iOS or [Google Play Store](#) for Android

3. Meeting Link

Meeting ID: 856 2352 1812

Passcode: 795179

Join by Telephone [Audio only]: US: +1 669 900 6833 or +1 213 338 8477 or +1 669 219 2599 or +1 646 518 9805

Meeting ID: 856 2352 1812

Passcode: 795179

Meeting will be recorded for minutes only and will not be published. By joining this meeting, you agree to be recorded during the duration of this meeting.

Daniel Lurie
Mayor

Joshua Arce
President

Stephen E. Leveroni
Vice President

Avni Jamdar
Commissioner

Kate H. Stacy
Commissioner

Meghan Thurlow
Commissioner

Dennis J. Herrera
General Manager



37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73

MEETING AGENDA

Materials Distributed: Special Meeting Agenda for November 4, 2025; Draft Special Meeting Minutes of September 9, 2025; "CleanPowerSF Solar Billing Plan"

1. Call to Order

The special meeting of the SFPUC Rate Fairness Board (RFB) was called to order at 10:01 AM in-person and via teleconference.

2. Roll Call

Member Name/Title	Appointed By
Howard Ash, Chair, Residential City Retail Customer	Board of Supervisors
Masood Samereie, Vice-Chair, City Retail Large Business Customer	Mayor's Office
Vishal Trivedi, Financial Analyst of Office of Public Finance	Controller's Office
Eric Dew, Residential City Retail Customer	Mayor's Office
Ben Becker, Refuse Rates Analyst	Controller's Office
Celeste Middleton, Principal Budget & Planning Analyst	City Administrator
Vacant, City Retail Small Business Customer	Board of Supervisors

Roll Call:

- *Present: Chair Ash, Vice-chair Samereie, Member Trivedi, Member Dew*

3. General Public Comment

Members of the public may address the Rate Fairness Board (RFB) on matters that are within the Board's jurisdiction but not on today's agenda.

Public Comment: No public comment.

4. Instate New Rate Fairness Board Members

- Celeste Middleton, City Administrator Appointing Office (Instate to Board)

Member Middleton from the City Administrator's Office was sworn in as the new representative, replacing Tricia McMahon. Member Middleton is a principal analyst specializing in data and strategic planning for the budget team.

Public Comment: No public comment

5. Approval of the Special Meeting Minutes of September 9, 2025

(Discussion and Action)

74 *Chair Ash asked Board for comments, questions, or concerns.*

75

76 *Public Comment: No public comment.*

77

78 *The minutes of the special meeting of September 9, 2025, were adopted*
79 *upon a motion by Member Trivedi and seconded by Vice-Chair Samereie.*

80

81 *Roll Call Vote:*

- 82 • *Ayes: Chair Ash, Vice-chair Samereie, Member Trivedi, Member Dew,*
83 *Member Middleton*

84

85 **6. Report of the Chair (Discussion Only)**

86

86 **a. CleanPowerSF Solar Billing Plan**

87

88 Staff presented a comprehensive proposal for a new solar billing tariff to
89 replace the existing Net Energy Metering (NEM) system for certain
90 customers. There are currently 13,500 NEM customers in Clean Power
91 SF service (3-4% of customer base), primarily residential, single-family
92 homes with rooftop solar. California's grid now experiences oversupply
93 of solar energy during midday hours. In 2024, California curtailed 3.4
94 million megawatt hours of renewable energy due to oversupply.

95

96 The objectives of the solar billing plan are to align incentives with
97 market conditions to encourage smarter on-site energy use, continue
98 supporting rooftop solar and electrification, ensuring equity and fairness
99 for low-income customers, and maintaining administrative feasibility.

100

101 The solar billing plan uses California Public Utilities Commission's
102 Avoided Cost Calculator (ACC) and values surplus energy sent to grid
103 on hourly basis which more closely aligns with actual market value than
104 retail rate. It includes a local energy credit of an additional 1.1 cents per
105 kilowatt hour for generation which reflects 15% higher value of local
106 generation vs. Northern California average.

107

108 An equity credit is also included which gives a 7 cent per kilowatt hour
109 bonus for low-income customers which applies to approximately 1,500
110 customers (11% of NEM base). This credit is designed to minimize bill
111 impacts during transition.

112

113 The solar billing plan also includes net surplus compensation which
114 gives 4 cents per kilowatt hour for annual net surplus generation, based
115 on renewable energy credit market value.

116

117 The expected customer impact for an average NEM customer with the
118 local energy credit, the increase is approximately \$21/month increase.
119 For low-income customers there is a minimal impact of approximately
120 \$0.49/month increase.

121

122 The solar billing plan is limited to customers with interconnections after
123 April 2023, customers with systems installed for more than 20 years,
124 and existing NEM customers grandfathered for 20 years from

125 installation date. Approximately 1,400 customers (10% of current NEM
126 base) would be immediately affected.

127
128 By 2031, there will be approximately \$1 million annually in savings with
129 \$28,000 in savings in the first year. Savings will be reinvested in battery
130 storage and electrification incentive programs.

131
132 Vice-chair Samereie questions about how to incentivize solar
133 installation for older homes and whether current proposal provides
134 sufficient support. Staff explains that homes should use electric devices
135 in order to maximize incentives.

136
137 Members discussed why the focus is on individual batteries rather than
138 grid-scale storage to capture midday solar surplus. Staff explained that
139 individual storage encourages right-sizing of systems and personal
140 responsibility for peak demand.

141
142 Members requested additional information on ACC development and
143 methodology. They expressed concern about complexity of
144 presentation for Commission review. Chair Ash suggested need for
145 simplified graphics and storytelling approach in presentation. Board
146 indicated need for an additional meeting before the Commission
147 presentation and time to digest information and develop their
148 recommendation.

149
150 *Public Comment:*

151
152 *Speaker Charles Adams criticized ACC methodology as flawed and*
153 *favoring monopoly utilities. Noted that the California Supreme Court*
154 *voted 12-0 against similar ACC approach. Argued that local generation*
155 *has greater value than 1 cent premium. Claimed that utility-scale solar*
156 *costs are artificially cheapened by tax equity and don't include*
157 *transmission costs. Called proposal a betrayal of community choice*
158 *aggregation principles.*

159
160 Speaker Mary Rodriguez-Gavill criticized proposal as benefiting PG&E
161 rather than CCA customers. Questioned the use of ACC designed for
162 monopoly utilities. Concerned about market collapse of residential solar.
163 Argued the proposal lacks courage to truly support local clean energy.
164 Noted solar incentives and tax credits are disappearing.

165
166 Speaker William Alschuler emphasized the need to account for external
167 costs of fossil fuels. Supported heat storage as alternative to batteries.
168 Noted external costs disproportionately affect low-income communities.
169 Called for more equitable accounting of solar benefits.

170
171
172 **b. Update on Power Rate Study**

173
174 Matthew Freiberg, Rates Manager, provided update on Power Rate
175 Study. The rate study is in the midst of cost-of-service analysis. They
176 have completed functionalization of operating budget, capital budget,
177 and debt service. Staff is meeting with rate consultants weekly or more

178 frequently. The customer billing data analysis was recently completed
179 as well.

180
181 The first draft of the CleanPowerSF cost of service model received. The
182 Hetch Hetchy cost of service model review is scheduled for November
183 10. The first view of the CleanPowerSF rate model is expected
184 November 20 and the Hetch Hetchy rate design on November 24th.The
185 preliminary rate design completion is expected December 1st.
186 Executives will review December 10th with final rates dependent on
187 budget and 10-year plan adoption.

188
189 For CleanPowerSF, the rate structure must align with PG&E with limited
190 structural changes expected. Rates will be based on cost of service
191 unlike most CCAs tied to percentage of PG&E.

192
193 For Hetch Hetchy Power, new rates will need to be created for SFO and
194 for Riverbank redevelopment area. They will re-evaluate time-of-use
195 periods and create future rates for: electrified ferry terminals, potential
196 data centers, clean steam customers.

197
198 Staff asked Board for preference on scheduling check-ins along the
199 process on cost-of service and rate design. Members expressed
200 preference for multiple check-ins during process rather than waiting for
201 final product. Members discuss scheduling of subsequent meeting and
202 attending Commission meeting.

203
204
205 *Public Comment: No public comment.*

206
207

208 **7. Announcements, Comments, Questions (Discussion)**

209
210 Members continue to discuss scheduling of subsequent meeting for first
211 week of December to discuss recommendation of solar billing plan.

212
213 Future meeting will review 10-year plan and final rate adoption
214 proposals.

215
216 For future meetings, members request analysis of competing viewpoints
217 from public comment and a simplified presentation approach for the
218 solar billing plan.

219
220
221 *Public Comment: No public comment.*

222
223

224 **8. Adjournment**

225
226 *Meeting adjourned at 11:53 AM.*

227 **Accessible Meeting Policy:** To obtain meeting materials in alternative format, please
228 contact the Rate Fairness Board Secretary at 415-487-5254 or via email at
229 RateFairnessBoard@sfwater.org. Providing at least 72 hours notice will help to
230 ensure availability. Written reports or background materials for calendar items are
231 available online at [sfpuc.gov/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-](http://sfpuc.gov/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-board)
232 [board](http://sfpuc.gov/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-board).

233
234 **Meeting Procedures:** Public Comment will be taken before or during the
235 Board's consideration of each agenda item. Speakers may address the Board
236 for up to three minutes on that item. During General Public Comment,
237 members of the public may address the Board on matters that are within the
238 Board's jurisdiction and are not on the agenda. Procedures do not permit: 1)
239 persons in the audience to vocally express support or opposition to statements
240 by Board Member, by other persons testifying; 2) ringing and use of cell
241 phones, pagers, and similar sound-producing electronic devices; 3) bringing in
242 or displaying signs in the meeting room; and 4) standing in the meeting room.
243 The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing
244 electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the
245 Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s)
246 responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-
247 producing electronic devices.

248
249 **Know your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance:** Government's duty is to
250 serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions,
251 boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct
252 the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted
253 before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For
254 information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the
255 San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the ordinance,
256 contact by mail Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett
257 Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102; phone at (415) 554-7724; fax at
258 (415) 554-7854; or by email at sotf@sfgov.org.

259
260 **Citizens may obtain a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance:** by printing
261 Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at
262 sfbos.org/sunshine.

263
264 **311 Free Language Assistance:** 免費語言協助 / Ayuda gratuita con el idioma
265 / Бесплатная помощь переводчиков / Trợ giúp Thông dịch Miễn phí /
266 Assistance linguistique gratuite / 無料の言語支援 / 무료 언어 / 지원 / ความช่วย
267 ยเหลือี ท่่งภ่ช่โดยไม่ว่ ส่ย์คหำไซจ้ าย / Libreng tulong para sa wikang Tagalog
268 ยเหลือี

269
270 **Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements:** Individuals and entities
271 that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action
272 may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign &

273 Governmental Conduct Code Sec. 2.100] to register and report lobbying
274 activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the
275 San Francisco Ethics Commission at 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, San
276 Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100; fax (415) 252-3112; web site
277 at sfgov.org/ethics.

278

279 Explanatory documents that have been provided to the Board in connection
280 with this agenda are available for public inspection online at [sfpuc.gov/about-](http://sfpuc.gov/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-board)
281 [us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-board](http://sfpuc.gov/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-board).

282