

**San Francisco Public Utilities Commission
Citizens' Advisory Committee
Wastewater Subcommittee**

MEETING MINUTES

**Tuesday, March 9, 2021
5:30 p.m. – 7:00 p.m.**

PARTICIPATE VIA BLUEJEANS VIRTUAL CONFERENCE SOFTWARE

Meeting URL

<https://bluejeans.com/192606065>

Phone Dial-in

408.317.9253

Meeting ID

192 606 065#

This meeting is being held by Teleconference Pursuant to the Governor's Executive Order N-29-20 and the Sixteenth Supplement to Mayoral Proclamation Declaring the Existence of a Local Emergency Dated February 25,2020

During the Coronavirus Disease (COVID-19) emergency, the San Francisco Public Utilities Citizens Advisory Committee's (SFPUC CAC) regular meeting room, 525 Golden Gate Ave., 3rd Floor Tuolumne Conference Room, is closed. CAC Members and SFPUC staff will convene CAC meetings remotely by teleconference. Members of the public are encouraged to submit their public comment on agenda items in advance of the teleconference meeting by emailing comments to cac@sfgwater.org. Comments submitted no later than 12 PM Tuesday the day of the meeting will be read into the record by SFPUC CAC Staffing Team members during the teleconference meeting and will be treated as a substitute to providing public comment during the meeting. Persons who submit written public comment in advance on an agenda item or items will not be permitted to also provide public comment on the same agenda item(s) during the meeting.

Mission: The Wastewater Subcommittee shall review sewage and stormwater collection, treatment, and disposal system replacement, recycling, and other relevant plans, programs, and policies ([Admin. Code Article XV, Sections 5.140 - 5.142](#)).

Members

Amy Nagengast, Chair (D8)	Amy Zock (D6)	Austin Hunter (M-Enviro.
Marria Evbuoma (D1)	Anietie Ekanem (D10)	Org)

D = District Supervisor appointed, M = Mayoral appointed, B = Board President appointed

Staff Liaisons: Tracy Zhu and Mayara Ruski Augusto Sa
Staff Email for Public Comment: cac@sfgwater.org

OUR MISSION: To provide our customers with high-quality, efficient and reliable water, power and sewer services in a manner that values environmental and community interests and sustains the resources entrusted to our care.

London N. Breed
Mayor

Sophie Maxwell
President

Anson Moran
Vice President

Tim Paulson
Commissioner

Ed Harrington
Commissioner

Newsha Ajami
Commissioner

Michael Carlin
Acting
General Manager



ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. Call to order and roll call

Members present at roll call: (3) Nagengast, Evbuoma, Hunter

Members Absent: (2) Zock, Ekanem

SFPUC Staff present: Anna Roche, Brian Carlomagno, Vincent Mazzaferro, Anna Roche, Michael Tran, Idil Bereket, Autum Cleave, Sabrina Suzuki

Members of the Public: Eliahu Perszyk, Sheena CJ

2. Approve [January 12, 2021](#) Minutes

Motion was made (Hunter) and seconded (Evbuoma) to approve the amended January 12, 2021 Minutes.

AYES: (3) Nagengast, Evbuoma, Hunter

NOES: (0)

ABSENT: (2) Zock, Ekanem

Public Comment: None

3. Report from the Chair

Welcome members, staff, and the public

Public Comment: None

4. Public Comment: Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda

Public Comment: None

5. Presentation and Discussion: [Westside Pump Station Reliability Improvements](#), Brian Carlomagno, Project Manager; Vincent Mazzaferro, Communications Associate

Presentation

- Agenda
- The SFPUC & our Wastewater System
- San Francisco Public Utilities Commission
- Our Combined Sewer System
- The Sewer System Improvement Plan (SSIP)
- SSIP's Levels of Service Goals

- Sewer System Improvement in your Neighborhood
- Westside Combined Sewer System
- Westside Pump Station Reliability Improvements
- Sewer System: Westside Watershed Overview
- WSS Reliability Improvements: facility needs; existing site plan; site improvements; PG&E Dual Power Feed;
- Preliminary Constructions Areas & Detour: Great Highway;
- Construction Schedule: approximately three years
- Perspective View of Improvements

Discussion:

- **Member Evbuoma** asked if there will be traffic impacts along Sloat Boulevard.

Staff Carlomagno answered positively. Through traffic is expected to be maintained during the construction period. There will be convergence of traffic, but the plan is to limit the construction area to one block at a time. No impact on parking.

- **Member Evbuoma** remarked that it is a challenge to use Sloat and asked if there is a project for the park.

Staff Carlomagno answered that the SFPUC meets with other agencies to coordinate projects in the area. The goal is to reduce the impact of the projects.

- **Member Hunter** asked traffic flow projects eliminate bike lanes and if there is current guidance to ensure pedestrian and cyclist safety.

Staff Carlomagno answered that SFMTA issues the permitting and the MTA dictates the requirements for that area. Staff Carlomagno offered to find out.

- **Member Hunter** commented that projects usually eliminate the bike line and asked what mitigation is in place to ensure bicyclists and pedestrian safety.

Staff Carlomagno answered that the contractors are required to get permits from the SFMTA. The SFMTA dictates the requirements for construction areas.

- **Member Hunter** commented that slide 18 has an estimated construction schedule that is different from the one listed in the quarterly summary report for the SSIP (page 32 - Westside Pump Station Improvements Project). The quarterly report estimated construction schedule as December 2024 and it also stated that the project is 18 million over budget. Member Hunter asked what can be done to put the project back on schedule.

Staff Carlomagno answered that the contract has been awarded to a contractor last month and it is thirty-four-month contract. The quarterly report may have not captured the latest schedule. The 18 million dollars was approved by the SFPUC Commission and the cost

adjustment is reflected in the actual cost of this project. The awarded bid price is 48.5 million dollars and that captures the 18 million dollars.

- **Member Hunter** asked if the lessons learned from the increase of cost of this project have been shared with sister projects or plans on mitigating the need of extending a project for years.

Staff Carlomagno answered that this is a better question to SFPUC's leadership. This project has been bid twice. In 2018, the market was aggressive. Covid changed the construction climate and it is now more favorable to utility projects. Estimates and values are exchanged between different projects. There is communication between PUC to learn and share lessons learned.

- **Member Hunter** commented that futures updates should include hurdles tackled with and tactics to overcome those hurdles.
- **Chair Nagengast** asked if this project is over 10,000 square feet and if it is subject to the SF Lead requirement as new construction. It is common for projects like this to have unflattering architecture.

Staff Carlomagno answered that the project has not applied for any Lead Certification.

- **Chair Nagengast** explained that it is part of the City Environmental Code and applicable to new construction.

Staff Carlomagno thanked CAC members for the opportunity to present the WSS Reliability Improvement Project. Staff Carlomagno added that the proposed new electrical building will have a floor area of 4,641 square feet.

Public Comment: None.

6. **Presentation and Discussion:** [Update on Ocean Beach Climate Change Adaptation Project](#), Anna Roche, Project Manager, Climate Change

Presentation:

- Ocean Beach Climate Change Adaptation – Long-term Improvements
- Multi-agency Project
- Location: Infrastructure at Risk
- Agenda
- Project History (Historic Approaches to Erosion)
- Project Drivers & Primary Objectives
- Project Drivers – Policy and Litigation
- Primary Project Objectives
- Short-term & Army Corps of Engineers
- Erosion South of Sloat Boulevard
- Short-term Improvements
- ACOE Beneficial Use of Dredged Material as Sand Nourishment (SFPUC is the local sponsor)
- Long-term Improvements 35% Design
- Wastewater Infrastructure at Risk

- Project Elements
- PUC Elements – Design Considerations
- Non-PUC Elements – Design Considerations
- Low Profile Wall – Cross Section
- Removal of Shoreline Armoring
- Sand Management Program
- Trail Design – Northern Reach
- Trail Design – Central Reach
- Trail Design – Southern Reach
- Restroom Facility
- Ocean Beach Project Schedule

Discussion:

- **Member Hunter** asked about accessibility to the public restrooms to unhoused people.

Staff Roche answered that the restroom will be a Parks and Recreation asset and they are responsible for the design. It is mostly meant to be a restroom and access for drinking water for the coastal trail. There are other restrooms in the area and there will be signs to indicate where public restrooms are available.

- **Member Hunter** commented that having access to clean water should be kept in mind.
- **Member Evbuoma** asked how much of the sand placement will be in sand bags.

Staff Roche answered that the sand bags are only been used now to address erosion issues. The sand bags are only meant to address erosion hot spots until the long-term project is developed. The plan is to add loose sand to ensure there is a wide enough beach that allows safe access and keeps the low-profile sea wall buried.

- **Member Evbuoma** asked if there is a plan to substitute the plastic sand bags with another material. The microplastics are hard to clean up.

Staff Roche answered that the current bags are made of a more environmentally friendly material. The material needs to be robust enough to remain intact. When the bags are replaced, the beach is cleaned. The park services is responsible for cleaning the beach.

Member Evbuoma mentioned that there is no cleaning happening and plastic is still plastic and asked for information about the material being used.

Public Comment: None.

7. Presentation and Discussion: [Sewer Laterals Program](#)

Presenters

- Michael Tran, Acting Technical Services Section Manager, Collection System Division, Wastewater Enterprise
- Idil Bereket, Communications Manager, External Affairs
- Autumn Cleave, Pollution Prevention Specialist, Collection System Division, Wastewater Enterprise

Presentation

- Sewer Laterals Program
- Combined Sewer System Collection System
- Sewer Lateral Typical Configuration and Responsibilities in SF
- Sewer Lateral Challenges
- Addressing Challenges
- Public Outreach and Engagement
- Proposed Strategy for Sewer Use Ordinance
- Timeline and Next Steps
- Public Outreach and Engagement – Ordinance-specific

Discussion

- **Member Evbuoma** asked if there is any collaboration between the SFPUC and Street Trees and Plants (Public Works) considering that this departments maintains street trees and sometimes the street trees encroach on pipes.

Staff Tran answered that tree roots are known for their impact on sewer infrastructure. The SFPUC coordinates efforts with the Department of Public Works to address tree root intrusions. The National Association of Sewer Service Companies have industry standards for all utilities, and they categorize tree roots as a maintenance issue. The SFPUC is looking into resources that can be offered to property owners such as educational outreach or proactive maintenance to help alleviate issues with tree roots. Also looking into alternate pipe materials that may be better suited when in proximity with trees.

- **Member Hunter** acknowledged the need to have a methodology to check who connects to the sewer system, but an additional permit might pose a burden and suggested considering using existing processes.

Staff Cleave answered that the sewer lateral inspection requirements will be included in an already existing permit issued by the Department of Building Inspection. The sewer connection permit will be its own permit, but the point made by Member Hunter will be taken into consideration.

- **Member Hunter** asked if the cost of the renovation is still a factor even if the renovation does not involve any water or sewer usage.

Staff Cleave answered that a 150,000-dollar renovation is presumed to include a kitchen or bathroom and would involve plumbing.

- **Member Hunter** asked if the parameter should not be renovations that involve either a kitchen or a bathroom.

Staff Cleave answered that this is a good point and it will be discussed with DBI. Other cities have been used as models and those were the main triggers, but this route can be considered.

- **Chair Nagengast** commented that the challenges and successes should be tracked and that should include metrics to check if the outreach, quality assurance program, and the construction standards were successfully achieved or met. The SFPUC cannot have preferred contractors but requiring some level of education or training could be a differentiator.

Public Comment: None.

8. Staff report

- SFPUC moves to www.sfpuc.org
- Reminder about empty seats

Public Comment: None.

9. Future Agenda Items and Resolutions

- Sewer Lateral Ordinance Update
- Wastewater Capital Update (project and cost control) – Steve Robinson
- Environmental Justice Analysis briefing
- Wastewater CAC staff
- Asset Management Integration – Wastewater policy and capital projects
- Green Infrastructure Program and Resolution Update
- Wastewater Communications Update
- Watershed Stewardship Grants
- Stormwater Management Ordinance and the Southeast Treatment Plant
- Environmental Justice in Capital Projects
- Upcoming Construction
- Workforce Programs and Qualifications
- Treasure Island Field Trip

Adopted Resolutions for Follow Up

- Resolution in Support of SFPUC Class A Biosolids Local Distribution Program [adopted August 21, 2018](#)
- Resolution in Support of Cityworks Interns Recommendations [adopted in November 21, 2017](#)
- Resolution in Support of Equitable Green Infrastructure Implementation throughout the Southeast Sector of San Francisco and throughout the City [adopted June 20, 2017](#)
- Resolution Urging SFPUC Commission to Initiate Planning and Environmental Review for Building a New Community Center at Third and Evans and to Direct Staff to Develop an Interim Greenhouse Environmental and Workforce Development Program [adopted on October 18, 2016](#)
- Resolution Supporting the SFPUC to Conduct Robust Community Engagement to Determine the Community's Preference for Remodeling Southeast Community Facility at 1800 Oakdale or Building a New Community Center at 1550 Evans [adopted on January 19, 2016](#)

Public Comment: None.

10. Announcements/Comments The next scheduled meeting of the Wastewater Subcommittee will take place on May 11, 2021. Visit www.sfwater.org/cac for final confirmation of the next meeting date.

11. Adjournment

Motion was made (Hunter) and seconded (Evbuoma) to adjourn the meeting.

Meeting was adjourned at 7:18 pm